



The Columbia Historic Zoning Commission will meet on Tuesday, June 18, 2024 at 4:00 PM in Council Chambers on the basement level of City Hall, 700 N. Garden Street, to consider the following:

- I. Roll Call
- II. Approval of Minutes
- III. Old Business
 - 1. Request from Veronica Quance for exterior alteration approval for windows removal at [905 School Street](#).
THIS ITEM WAS DEFERRED FROM A PREVIOUS AGENDA
- IV. New Business
 - 1. Request from Weston Blankenship for site and facade modifications at 1 [122 South High Street](#).
- V. Other Business
 - 1. Administrative CoAs
 - 2. Staff Updates
- VI. Adjourn

Anyone requesting accommodations due to disabilities should contact the City's ADA Coordinator at 931-560-1570 prior to the meeting.

The 2024 meeting schedule and Historic District Design Guidelines can be found on the City of Columbia Historic Zoning Commission webpage.

An interactive map showing the boundaries of the historic districts can be found

accessed from the City's website.

For other questions, please contact the Department of Development Services at 931-560-1560.



CITY OF COLUMBIA TENNESSEE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION SUPPLEMENTAL STAFF REPORT

CONTACT INFORMATION

Robert Archibald, Planning Associate II, rarchibald@columbiatn.com, 931-560-1536

DOCKET/CASE/APPLICATION NUMBER

CA 24-0165

APPLICANT/PROPERTY OWNER

Veronica Quance/Fixer Station, LLC

HEARING DATE

June 18th, 2024

PROPERTY ADDRESS/LOCATION

905 School Street

PROJECT DESCRIPTION: Certificate of Appropriateness request for removal of four windows at rear elevation.

The applicant requests a Certificate of Appropriateness to remove four previously approved windows at rear elevation.

Specifically, the applicant requests to remove four windows from the rear elevation as proposed in the previous submittal that came before the Commission September 2023. The applicant requests the removal due to redundancy in the openings in relation to the space.



Staff Analysis:

The applicant is requesting to remove a total of four windows from the rear elevation at 905 School Street. Previously the applicant requested a Certificate of Appropriateness to repair siding, replace the roof covering, and demolish a secondary upper-story porch addition during a restoration proposal. This request was reviewed and approved by the Historic Zoning Commission on September 20, 2023. The previous approval was to demo the upper level porch elevation and install three windows in this location to complete the alignment of openings correlating with the other elevations on the structure. The request was deferred by the HZC, and the applicant was instructed to appear in the June meeting with additional information that could support the request.

Staff followed up with applicant and met on site on June 4th, 2024 at which time staff observed the following:

- The existing openings at the rear upper-story elevation appear to have been created originally for door openings, which would access the second-story sleeping porch previously approved to be demolished. Framing members which were used in the walls at time of construction of the home are sawn-milled lumber 2 x 6 framed. The openings indicate that structural framing of the exterior wall was altered to create openings for doors. These facts are supplemented by the attached Contractor Assessment and Photos in Exhibit A.

4.10 Retain the Character and Arrangement of Historic Window Openings

- a. The pattern, shape, and configuration of historic window openings shall be retained. Reducing, enlarging, or infilling windows on the façade or prominent secondary elevations shall be avoided.
- e. The installation of horizontal, picture, round, or bay windows where they are incompatible with the age and style of the building is prohibited.

The secondary rear elevation at 905 School St is not a prominent feature and there is no historic evidence to suggest the window openings were original to construction.

Based on the evidence that exists on site and the additional evidence the applicant has submitted, staff does support approval of the Certificate of Appropriateness request for removal of the originally proposed window additions. To add the windows where they have not existed would create a false sense of historical relevance and be detrimental to the character of the home and the historical district.

Recommendation: Approve

Recommended Motion:

Motion [Approve]:

Move to find that the proposal conforms to the Historic District Design Guidelines and approve issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Alternative Motions:

Alternative Motion [Approve Subject to Conditions]

Move to approve issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness and find that the proposal conforms to the Historic District Design Guidelines subject to the following conditions: [list conditions of approval]

Alternative Motion [Defer for Future Consideration]:

Move to find that there is insufficient information to make a decision, defer the application, and request that the applicant provide: [list additional information] for review at a future meeting.

Alternative Motion [Deny]:

Move to find that the proposal is not compatible with the Historic District Design Guidelines, and deny issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness [list reasons for denial].



CITY OF COLUMBIA TENNESSEE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION STAFF REPORT

CONTACT INFORMATION

Robert Archibald, Planning Associate II, rarchibald@columbiatn.com, 931-560-1536

DOCKET/CASE/APPLICATION NUMBER

CA 24-0165

APPLICANT/PROPERTY OWNER

Veronica Quance/Fixer Station, LLC

HEARING DATE

May 9, 2024

PROPERTY ADDRESS/LOCATION

905 School Street

PROJECT DESCRIPTION: Certificate of Appropriateness request for removal of four windows at rear elevation.

The applicant requests a Certificate of Appropriateness to remove four existing windows at rear elevation.

Specifically, the applicant requests to remove four windows from the rear elevation as proposed in the previous submittal that came before the Commission September 2023. The applicant requests the removal due to redundancy in the openings in relation to the space.



EXISTING ZONING	EXISTING LAND USE	SURROUNDING ZONING & LAND USE	SITE IMPROVEMENTS	Historic District
CD-3 (Neighborhood Character District)	Residential	CD-3 (Residential)	New Construction 3,012 s/f two-story Single-Family Residential	Athenaeum

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

APPROVE

APPROVE WITH CONDITIONS

DENY

Review Status and History:

<i>Submission Status:</i>	Second request for a Certificate of Appropriateness at this address.
<i>Previous Approvals:</i>	23-0304, Approval, Exterior repair and replacement of siding, roof covering, decorative trim and corbels. Demolition of second-story structure and installation of doors and windows to match existing windows and doors
<i>1984 Historic Inventory:</i>	N/A. The Athenaeum Historic District is a locally designated historic district which is not listed on the National Registry of Historic Places (although structures within are listed individually). There is no complete inventory of historic structures within the District.

Proposed Alterations

Removal of windows from rear elevation

Historic District Design Guidelines Referenced:

Staff reviewed the request for consistency with the *City of Columbia Historic Design Guidelines* for removal of residential windows. Staff comments follows in the next section.

Note on Windows, page 4.8

Maintain serviceable historic windows where they exist.

4.10 Retain the Character and Arrangement of Historic Window Openings

- a) The pattern, shape, and configuration of historic window openings shall be retained. Reducing, enlarging, or infilling windows on the façade or prominent secondary elevations shall be avoided.

Staff Analysis:

The applicant is requesting to remove a total of four windows from the rear elevation at 905 School Street. Previously the applicant requested a Certificate of Appropriateness to repair siding, replace the roof covering, and demolish a secondary upper-story porch addition during a restoration proposal. This request was reviewed and approved by the Historic Zoning Commission on September 20, 2023. The previous approval was to demo the upper level porch elevation and install three windows in this location to complete the alignment of openings correlating with the other elevations on the structure. Illustrations below show the approved façade change compared to the current proposal before the Commission.



Approved Rear Elevation, Sept. 2023



New Proposed Elevation

905 School street is a two-story structure facing the primary frontage with a large full-façade front porch having classical columns supporting the flat roof structure. the exterior walls are wood lap siding and corbeling is present on all sides of the home. The front of the second-story roof has a shed roof dormer with three small wood-cased windows. all other windows are wood-cased as well. The front door is paneled with fixed glass having paneled sidelights on both sides. Staff would surmise that the original configuration of the three windows on the upper-story front façade was, at one time, replicated in on the upper-story rear elevation and was subsequently hidden from view by the recently demolished porch on the upper story.

Staff does not support approval of the Certificate of Appropriateness request.

Recommendation: Deny

Recommended Motion:

Motion [Deny]:

Move to find that the proposal is not compatible with the Historic District Design Guidelines, and deny issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness [list reasons for denial].

Alternative Motions:

Alternative Motion [Approve]:

Move to find that the proposal conforms to the Historic District Design Guidelines and approve issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Alternative Motion [Defer for Future Consideration]:

Move to find that there is insufficient information to make a decision, defer the application, and request that the applicant provide: [list additional information] for review at a future meeting.

Alternative Motion [Approve Subject to Conditions]

Move to approve issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness and find that the proposal conforms to the Historic District Design Guidelines subject to the following conditions: [list conditions of approval]



Archived: Monday, June 10, 2024 8:52:45 AM
From: Tom Price
Sent: Wed, 5 Jun 2024 10:27:16
To: veronicaquance@gmail.com
Subject: 905 School Street
Importance: Normal

Mrs. Quance,

Thank you for visiting the archives today concerning your property.

After researching 905 School Street, specifically tracking deeds, inspecting Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps, historical newspapers, biographies of property owners, general histories, etc., it appears that the home was significantly altered, if not rebuilt, between 1909 and 1914. This is clearly delineated on Sanborn maps. Unfortunately, none of our resources clearly specify window placement on the back of the building. There are examples of American four-square buildings with no rear windows that are to accommodate rear-L's and porches with pitched roofs...not unlike your property. One such building in close proximity would be the Foster-Allen House (1909) on School Street. The rear has no windows to accommodate the pitch of the one-story section on the back of the structure.

As we talked about, symmetry in four-square style architecture is not always a given, either. A good example of that is the Whitthorne House at 1108 W. 7th Street (see attachment). You will see an asymmetrical window/door alignment featured in that property.

There are many examples of "vernacular" four-square architecture that deviate from classic definitions of the architectural style that owners incorporated based on personal preference and function. In these cases, clues may be gleaned from construction elements that remain from earlier periods. Your supposition based on original wall studs cut to accommodate a later addition is an excellent example. These kinds of clues give us our best glimpses into the "secrets" many of the older homes contain concerning later additions and changes. I have worked on a number of historic preservation and restoration projects where these types of clues reveal much about how the house was built and used. The Polk Home, Rally Hill, Mayes Place, and the Jackson-Looney House, all in Columbia are all great examples. None of them are of the same architectural style, but all have been altered over time and have been or are being returned to their original layouts based on what construction methods tell us.

Please let me know if we can be of further service. We appreciate your sensitivity to historic preservation and your desire to "get it right."

Best,

Thomas Price, Director

Maury County Archives

201 East Sixth Street

Columbia, TN 38401

(1)



Summary

Created: Tue, 6/4/2024

905 school st. assessment of rear egress construction timeline and framing member alteration suggesting that egresses were installed at a later date than original construction. Differences in height and trim to the openings in question suggest different framing layout than the adjacent windows.



(2)



Rear Left Bedroom

Created: Tue, 6/4/2024

Wide view

(3)



Rear Left Bedroom

Created: Tue, 6/4/2024

Visible 2x4 jack studs, possibly installed to adjust for egress construction (header support) and cut original 2x6 wall studs.



(4)



Rear Left Bedroom

Created: Tue, 6/4/2024

Circled is altered 2x6 wall stud with 2x4 jack studs underneath.

(5)



Rear Left Bedroom

Created: Tue, 6/4/2024

Altered wall studs, lower portion



(6)



Rear Left

Created: Tue, 6/4/2024

Additional photo of altered wall studs

(7)



Rear Right Bedroom

Created: Tue, 6/4/2024

Wide view

(8)



Rear Right Bedroom

Created: Tue, 6/4/2024

(9)



Rear Right Bedroom

Created: Tue, 6/4/2024

Altered wall studs below height of adjacent window further suggesting a door was placed in lieu of a window.



(10)



Rear Right Bedroom

Created: Tue, 6/4/2024

(11)



Rear Right Bedroom

Created: Tue, 6/4/2024



(12)



Rear Right Bedroom

Created: Tue, 6/4/2024

Altered wall studs further up cavity

(13)



Rear Right Bedroom

Created: Tue, 6/4/2024

(14)



Rear Right Bedroom

Created: Wed, 6/5/2024

Wide view shows similar differences in height, suggesting another possible door to access other side of porch.

(15)



Rear Left Bedroom

Created: Wed, 6/5/2024

Differences in height and placement of trim and altered wall studs suggests that door was added at a later date for access



to the porch that existed at the rear of home.











Downstairs Bath



Upstairs Rear bedroom Right



Upstairs Rear bedroom Left





HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS APPLICATION AND CHECKLIST

*Please submit the Application online at [City of Columbia | Permitting \(onlana.com\)](http://City of Columbia | Permitting (onlana.com))
If there is not access to a computer, please submit all pertinent information on a flash drive as well as
provide one hard copy*

APPLICATION REVIEW GUIDELINES (PRE-APPLICATION MEETING REQUIRED PRIOR TO SUBMITTAL)

Application Requirements: All applications must be complete and include the required supporting materials listed on this form and must be submitted to the Development Services Department for review by the published deadline. Incomplete applications will not be forwarded to the HZC for consideration.

Application Deadlines: Applications and support materials must be submitted according to the published Deadline Schedule.

Application Representation: The applicant or an authorized representative of the applicant **must attend the HZC meeting to support the application**. At the meeting, staff will present a recommendation for the item. The applicant will be asked to discuss the proposed scope of work and answer any commission questions.

Building Permit Requirements: In addition to an application, most proposals will require additional permitting from the City of Columbia. Building or demolition permits cannot not be issued without an approved COA for structures within a Historic District.

All work specifications must be completed as presented and approved: The HZC must review and approve any modifications or amendments to approved plans prior to any work taking place.

*Please contact City Staff with any questions or to discuss any concerns during the HZC review & submittal process:
Columbia Development Services Department (931) 560-1560.*

HISTORIC DISTRICT DESIGN GUIDELINES

The *Historic District Design Guidelines* provide guidance for most commonly proposed changes. The HZC consults the design criteria when reviewing applications for Certificates of Appropriateness. **Please refer to the guidelines prior to submitting an application.** The guidelines, along with other useful links, are available on the City of Columbia website at www.columbiatn.com

REQUIRED APPLICATION SUPPORTING MATERIALS

Please consult the list below for the necessary supporting materials to include within application packets. Please submit the application and upload supporting documents at [City of Columbia | Permitting \(onlana.com\)](http://City of Columbia | Permitting (onlana.com)). If there is not access to a computer, a flash drive with all pertinent documentation as well as one hard copy are required for HZC review:

NEW CONSTRUCTION, NEW ADDITIONS	EXTERIOR ALTERATIONS	DEMOLITION, RELOCATION
○ Description of project and proposed materials ○ Site plan ○ Lot survey ○ Architectural elevations or drawings ○ Photographs of project site location ○ Photographs of existing building.	○ Description of project and proposed materials ○ Photographs of project site location ○ Architectural elevations or drawings ○ Specification information for any proposed materials/architectural features ○ Documentation of earlier historic appearance (restoration only) ○ Photographs of existing building.	○ Please consult the <i>Historic District Design Guidelines</i>. Pre-application meeting with the City Staff is required for proposed principal structure demolitions and relocations.

Note: The applicant shall provide any additional information requested by the Development Services Department that will be necessary to obtain a full and complete review of the request by City Staff and/or by the Historic Zoning Commission. The Columbia Historic Zoning Commission follows the *Secretary of the Interiors Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings*. Further guidance may be found online: <http://www.nps.gov/tps/standards/rehabilitation.htm>

CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS APPLICATION

HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION

APPLICANT

NAME	Veronica Quance	PHONE	615-903-0033
ADDRESS	905 School St Columbia TN	EMAIL	veronicaquance@gmail.com

PROPERTY OWNER

NAME	Fixer Station LLC	PHONE	615-903-0033
ADDRESS	3225 McLeod Dr, Suite 100, Las Vegas, NV 89121	EMAIL	veronicaquance@gmail.com

DATE OF PRE-APPLICATION MEETING	
---------------------------------	--

PROJECT INFORMATION: WORK SPECIFIC

☐ NEW CONSTRUCTION <i>(select type)</i> ☐ Principle Structure ☐ Accessory Structure	☐ NEW ADDITION <i>(select type)</i> ☐ Principle Structure ☐ Accessory Structure
☐ DEMOLITION <i>(select type)</i> ☐ Principle Structure ☐ Accessory Structure ☐ Site Features ☐ <i>Loss of architectural and historical integrity and its removal will not adversely affect the district's historic character</i> ☐ <i>Denial of demolition will result in unreasonable economic hardship of the applicant</i> ☐ <i>Public safety and welfare requires the removal of the structure(s)</i> ☐ <i>Structural instability or deterioration of structure(s) as demonstrated through report by structural engineer or architect. Report clearly details physical condition of structure(s), reasons why rehabilitation is not feasible, and cost estimates for rehabilitation versus demolition. Additional report details proposed future action on site.</i>	☐ SIGNAGE <i>(select type)</i> ☐ Wall ☐ Freestanding ☐ Window ☐ Temporary ☐ Other ☒ EXTERIOR ALTERATIONS <i>(select type)</i> ☐ Roofing/Roof Structure (Dormers, Chimneys) ☐ Exterior Door Replacement/Alterations ☒ Exterior Window Replacement/Alterations ☐ Foundation Alterations ☐ Exterior Siding/Finishes/Masonry ☐ Porch/Deck Alterations ☐ Other (explain):

PROJECT INFORMATION	
ADDRESS:	905 School St Columbia TN 38401
SQUARE FOOTAGE OF PROPOSED ADDITIONS/NEW CONSTRUCTION :	
EXISTING: _____ ft ²	PROPOSED: _____ ft ²
HEIGHT OF STRUCTURE FOR ADDITIONS/NEW CONSTRUCTION :	
EXISTING: _____ ft	PROPOSED: _____ ft
SQUARE FOOTAGE OF PROPOSED SIGNAGE:	

PROJECT INFORMATION: DESCRIPTION & SCOPE OF PROJECT
DESCRIBE PROPOSED PROJECT(S) AND LIST ALL PROPOSED MATERIALS. ATTACH ADDITIONAL SHEETS IF NECESSARY: Our project at 905 School St is progressing smoothly, and I'm reaching out to request an amendment to the rear elevation of the property. Specifically, I would like to propose the removal of four windows from the original proposed elevation. As you are aware, we removed the rotted sleeping porch from the rear of the house. Initially, my intention was to replace the door openings with windows; however, this poses challenges with furniture placement in the spaces. Additionally, three of the windows slated for potential removal are redundant as there are existing windows in the same spaces. The fourth window, located in the upper center, was mistakenly included in the original rendering and is situated in a small bathroom. I have enclosed photos for your reference.

In filling out this application, I attest that (1) I am familiar with the rules, regulations, and procedures of the City of Columbia.

Veronica Quance

 APPLICANT NAME

Fixer Station LLC

 PROPERTY OWNER NAME

Veronica Quance

 APPLICANT SIGNATURE

Veronica Quance

 PROPERTY OWNER SIGNATURE

3/26/2024

 DATE

3/26/2024

 DATE

